To the Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health Care 11/15/2024

REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF "NATIONAL RESEARCH ONCOLOGY CENTER" LLP FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF POSTGRADUATE AND ADDITIONAL EDUCATION (CONTINUOUS PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)

Period of external expert evaluation: October 22-24, 2024

Astana, 2024

CONTENTS

-		
	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP	4
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the self-assessment report of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP	7
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external institutional assessment of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP	9
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP	29
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	29
	Annex 1. Institutional quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP	30
	Annex 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	31
	Annex 3. Program of the external expert commission's visit to the organization	32

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation			
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in			
	Education and Health Care			
EEC	External Expert Commission			
LLP "NSOC"	Limited Liability Partnership "National Scientific Oncology			
	Centre"			
NSOC	National Scientific Oncology Center			
Department	Education Department			
EP	Educational programme			
CPD	Continuous Professional Development			
PET/CT	Positron Emission Tomography in Combination with Computed			
	Tomography			
SPECT/CT	Single-Photon Emission Computed Tomograph Combined with			
	Computed Tomography			
STP	Scientific and Technical Project			
AIS	Automated Information System			
RSP on the REM				
	Management			
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Examination			
Mini CEX	Mini-Clinical Examination			
IEP	Individual Educational Plan			
MMC	Morbidity and mortality conference			
CED	catalog of elective disciplines			
Academic staff	Academic staff			
EMC	educational and methodological council			
MOH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan			
EMCD	educational and methodological sets of disciplines			
ADP RK	Administrative Department of the President of the Republic			
	Kazakhstan			
IMIS	Integrated Medical Information System			
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council			
NJSC	Non-profit Joint Stock Company			
	Standard Operating Procedure			

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 33 dated 07.10.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external institutional assessment of the "National Research Oncology Centre" LLP (hereinafter referred to as the educational organization) in the period from October 22 to 24, 2024, in the following composition:

N⁰	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairman	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Centre for Postgraduate Education of JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", Member of the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan
2	Foreign expert	Rakhmatullaev Akmal Abadbekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Dean of the 1st Paediatric Faculty, Head of the Department of Faculty Paediatric Surgery, Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation of the Tashkent Paediatric Medical Institute, Awarded the "Mehr- Sakhovat" medal
3	Academic expert	Dzhambulova Bela Telmanovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Course on Urology and Andrology of the NJSC "Kazakhstan- Russian Medical University"
4	Academic expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiology of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", Member of the Local Ethics Commission on Research Work, Internal Auditor of the Quality Management Service.
5	Employers' representative	Ospanova Madina Yeralievna	Head of the Department of Cellular Technologies of the RSE on the REM "Scientific and Production Centre for Transfusiology" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
6	Residents' representative	Aida Kabyldina	second-year resident in the specialty "Radiology" of the NAO "Astana Medical University"

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the educational organization for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate and additional education (continuous professional development) (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for accreditation), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of quality and recommendations for accreditation of the educational organization for the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA.

2. General part of the final report 2.1 Presentation of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP

3

Name of the organization, legal form	Limited Liability Partnership "National Scientific
of ownership, BIN	Oncology Centre" BIN 180740003103
Managing body	Supervisory Board Board
Full name of the first director	Burkitbayev Zhandos Konysovich
Date of establishment	May 1, 2019
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, 010000
	Astana, "Nura" district,
	Kerey st., Zhanibek khandar, 3
	Tel.: +7 (7172) 70 29 59
	E-mail: kense.777@mail.ru
	<i>Official website: http://cancercenter.kz</i>
State license for educational	Licenses No. KZ59LAA00035999 dated 12/14/2023
activities in residency (date, number)	
Information on branches,	-
subsidiaries (if any)	
Year of commencement of	Start year - 2019
educational activities in residency	Total 181
(postgraduate education) and total	
number of graduates	
Duration of training in residency	Educational programme
	1) "Adult oncology" - 2 years of study;
	2) "Adult Haematology" - 2 years of study;
	3) "Radiology" - 2 years of study;
	4) "Adult and Paediatric Gastroenterology" - 2 years of
	study;
	5) "General Surgery" - 3 years of study;
	6) "Adult and Paediatric Urology and Andrology" - 3
	years of study;
	7) "Adult and Paediatric Anaesthesiology and
	Resuscitation" - 3 years of study;
	8) "Adult and Paediatric Angiosurgery" - 4 years of
	study;
Number of residents in the current	Educational programme
academic year	1) "Adult Oncology" - 13;
	2) "Adult Haematology" - 16;
	3) "Radiology" - 18;
	4) "Adult and Paediatric Gastroenterology" - 7;
	5) "General surgery" - 17;
	6) "Urology and andrology for adults and children" - 9;
	7) "Anesthesiology and resuscitation for adults and abildron" 10:
	children" - 10; 8) "Angiosurgery for adults and children" 19:
Quality indicators in residency	8) "Angiosurgery for adults and children" - 19; The number of students expelled over a 5 year period is
	The number of students expelled over a 5-year period is 0, including 0 for academic failure.
	Graduates – 181
	Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years:
	2019 - 100%
	2020 - 100%
	2021 - 100%

	2022 - 100%
	2023 - 100%
	2024 - 100%
Year of commencement of	Start year – 2020
implementation of additional and	Total number of continuing education programs – 16
non-formal education programs,	Total number of students trained – 1164
total number of programs and	
number of trained students	
Number of distance education	Total - 0, with 0 academic hours
programmes	Developed this year - 0
Number of students in the current	89
year	
Full-time teachers/part-time workers	Total number of teachers – 63, including full-time - 63,
involved in the implementation of	part-time - 0.
residency and additional education	
programs, incl. % of Sedateness	Sedateness 58%
Presence of a department responsible	Name: Education Department
for the educational process	Year of establishment 2019
-	Head: Head of Department - Almira Zhukubaeva
	Assetkyzy, Master of Education, Doctor of the highest
	category
Number of scientific projects over 5	5
years	
Number of international agreements	25
over 5 years	
Website	Official website: http://cancercenter.kz
Instagram	Instagram – https://www.instagram.com/astana.nroc
Facebook with active pages	https:// https://www.facebook.com/astana.nroc
Information on accreditation as a	No. KZ70VEG00013182
medical organization (date, No.,	10.03.2023
period)	
number of trained students Number of distance education programmes Number of students in the current year Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of residency and additional education programs, incl. % of Sedateness Presence of a department responsible for the educational process Number of scientific projects over 5 years Number of international agreements over 5 years Website Instagram Facebook with active pages Information on accreditation as a medical organization (date, No.,	Developed this year - 0 89 Total number of teachers – 63, including full-time - 65 part-time - 0. Sedateness 58% Name: Education Department Year of establishment 2019 Head: Head of Department - Almira Zhukubaev Assetkyzy, Master of Education, Doctor of the highe category 5 25 Official website: http://cancercenter.kz Instagram – https://www.instagram.com/astana.nroc https:// https://www.facebook.com/astana.nroc No. KZ70VEG00013182

Strengths of the educational organization and achievements over 5 years:

1. In 2023, a category 1 certificate was received, certifying compliance with the National Standards for accreditation in the Field of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, issued by the Public Association of Experts and Consultants on External Comprehensive Assessment in Healthcare, date of issue 03/10/2023 for a period of 3 years;

2. In 2024, NSOC was accredited as a subject of scientific and (or) scientific and technical activity No. 000622 dated 09/16/2024, for a period of 5 years;

3. In 2022, NSOC passed the international Specialized accreditation for compliance with the standards of residency programs (8 programs in total);

4. A clear vision and strategic planning in postgraduate education in the clinical direction and an appropriate management structure operating in accordance with the Strategic Plan of the NSOC for 2024-2028, agreed upon with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and approved by the decision of the Supervisory Board of the NSOC dated August 16, 2024;

5. The ability to train residents at the clinical departments of the NSOC and leading medical scientific and practical institutions of Astana. The material and technical base, including clinical bases, meet the requirements for conducting full-fledged educational activities with residents; allow them to master the principles of diagnosis and treatment at a modern level. The scientific and clinical base of the NSOC contributes to the intensification of educational and clinical processes, and the conduct of scientific research.

5

6. Cooperation with practical healthcare in training residents through a mentoring system in accordance with the Regulation on a clinical mentor (No. 262 dated September 12, 2022);

7. Responsibilities and obligations for the management of the educational programme have been defined, the Education Department has been created;

8. There are collegial bodies (Academic Council, Educational and Methodological Council);

9. Automation of the educational process: AIS "Platonus", issuance of electronic certificates through eGov.kz and eLicense.kz;

10. Availability of our own peer-reviewed journal "Oncology.kz", published quarterly (eISSN 2957-6377) has been published since March 2022. – <u>http://oncologykz.org/</u>.

11. NSOC regularly interacts with leading international organizations to develop key areas of activity.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

In October 2019, NSOC underwent institutional accreditation in the field of continuous professional development (postgraduate and additional education) for compliance with the standards of the NEI "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care" (hereinafter referred to as ECAQA), which is included in the register of recognized accreditation bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Based on the results of the assessment of the external expert commission, the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA assigned NSOC the status of an accredited organization providing additional education with the issuance of certificate No. IA00021 dated 04.10.2019 for a period of 5 years https://enic-kazakhstan.edu.kz/ru/accreditation/organizacii-dopolnitelnogo-obrazovaniya.

2.3 Brief description of the self-assessment report of the "National Research Oncology Centre", LLP

The institutional self-assessment report of the "National Research Oncology Centre" LLP (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 100 pages of the main text, 59 pages of annexes, copies or electronic versions of 67 documents located at the link <u>https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1a4vIoc3nt7cSuX6csABODSns51qN4x_p?usp=drive_link</u>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main standards for accreditation and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of medical educational organizations of the ECAQA, provided to the "National Research Oncology Centre" LLP by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific and Educational Affairs Shalekenov S.B., which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 17 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment - Zhukubayeva Almira Assetkyzy, Head of the Education Department of LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre".

The institutional self-assessment was carried out on the basis of the order of the Chairman of the Board of LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre" No. 273 dated September 13, 2024 "On preparation for institutional and specialized accreditation in postgraduate and additional education.".

All standards provide real practice of organizing education for training residents in 8 specialties and students in 16 additional and non-formal education programs. The description in the selfassessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, and knowledge and skills assessment results. Information is included on the in-house material and technical base with a total area of 24,916.0 m2 and the number of beds - 360, as well as third-party clinical bases (9 in total), contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development and improvement plans, etc. The report is submitted to the ECAQA in its completed form, with data adjustments based on the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain links in the text and are numbered continuously.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the institutional assessment of the "National Research Oncology Centre" LLP was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational programmes of the ECAQA. Dates of the visit to the organization: October 22-24, 2024.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of the external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff 7 people;
- interviews with residents 27 people;
- meeting with students 20 people;
- studying the website https://cancercenter.edu.kz/index.php/ru;
- interviewing 21 employees, 4 teachers, 18 mentors;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents 21 and 27, respectively;
- observation of training of students/residents: attendance of 1 lecture (topic: "Basic aspects of hematology", hematologist, PhD Ainabay Ayagul Maratovna, students 4); practical classes of residents
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling standards for accreditation: 2 clinical training bases were visited, with the participation of 4 full-time teachers: LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre" and the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre", where training is conducted under 2 educational programmes; In addition, a review of the new building of LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre" was conducted;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 21 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

Table 1 - **Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC**

N⁰	Position	Quantity
1	Radiology, MD, Senior Lecturer Akhmetov Yermek Abibullaevich, Head	2/3 (5)
	of the Department of Radiological Diagnostics Dzhakipov Murat	
	Abdrakhmanovich.	
	Residents: Sarsenbayev Alisher Kairatully, Andreeva Ksenia Alekseevna,	
	Sherullayev Islam Sheryazdanovich	
2	Urology - Mugalbekov Shalkarbek Bakirovich, Asykpayev Mels	2/2 (4)
	Nurseitovich	
	Residents: Tileukhan Mukhtar, Adek Kurban	
3	General Surgery - Spatayev Zhanat Seitbatalovich; PhD, Batyrbekov Kanat	2/3 (5)
	Umerzakovich	
	Residents: Kulanbaeva Adina, Kokteubaev Aidar, Ibysheva Botagoz	
4	Anesthesiology and resuscitation - Umbetzhanov Yerlan Urumbaevich,	2/3 (5)

	PhD Zhumabaev Murat Bolatovich	
	Resident: Utenova Bekzada, Aubakir Shingis, Imanberdi Dauren	
5	Oncology: Umerzakova Bakhytzhan Gabdurakhimovna	1/2 (3)
	Resident: Sarsembek Asel, Muhambet Gulzhan	
6	Angiosurgery - Chinaliyev Azat Myrzabaevich, Dastan Sabyruly	2/3 (5)
	Resident: Akjol Darkhan, Bolat Diyas, Kenzhigaliev Galymbek	
7	Doctor of Hematology, Ainabay Ayagul Maratovna	1/2 (3)
	Residents: Zhuldyz Iskakova, Roza Ibragimova	
8	Gastroenterology: Zhanaspaeva Marzhan Siyazbekovna	1/4 (5)
	Residents: Arina Razmazina, Malika Khasenova, Aida Dauletbayeva,	
	Gulbanu Pernebaeva	
10	Simulation room: PhD Zhumabayev Murat Bolatovich, an anesthesiologist-	1 (1)
	reanimatologist	

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external assessment results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Institutional Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria of the "National Research Oncology Centre" LLP for Compliance with the ECAQA Standards for accreditation". The EEC members did not make any comments. Recommendations for improvement for the educational organization were discussed and the chairperson, Saule Askerovna Yesenkulova, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team, prompt provision of information to the EEC members.

While conducting a survey of residents, 100% rated the work of the External Expert Commission for Accreditation as positive. The majority of respondents (100%) believe that it is necessary to conduct accreditation of an educational organization or educational programmes.

According to 100% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and staff of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the institutional accreditation.

3. Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of external evaluation of the "National Research Oncology Centre" LLP

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission

During the implementation of the activities of the visit program, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body (educational and methodological council, Academic Council), in interviews with residents, students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational organization, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission was communicated to residents and students through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The Strategic Plan of NSOC LLP for 2024-2028, agreed with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and approved by the decision of the Supervisory Board of NSOC LLP dated August 16, 2024, was reviewed, including such areas as "Patient focus", through the provision of medical services based on high professionalism and respect for the dignity of each patient, ensuring quality, safety and convenience for patients and visitors; "Academicity" through the formation of a new formation of medical personnel and ensuring the process of continuous education at all levels of professional activity;

"International quality standards"; "Competitiveness"; "Provision of all levels and types of medical services at the level of international standards"; "Social responsibility"; "Financial stability" and "Transparency of management", which confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization.

From interviews with residents it was established that before classes begin, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases.

During the visit to the departments, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization, including the presence of a powerful material and technical base for the provision of medical services (9 clinical and 5 paraclinical centres, a consultative and diagnostic unit for 17 specialty profiles, nuclear and radiation therapy centres), it is planned to provide high-tech specialized medical care for oncological diseases.

In LLP "NSOC" there are departments that are directly related to the educational process, which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological assistance, the marketing department, international cooperation. This conclusion was made during the visit of the EEC to the listed structural divisions of LLP "NSOC", which contribute to the positive positioning of NSOC as a Clinic of the best world practices, through partnership, interaction with leading foreign clinics.

The results of the documentation study demonstrate that the organization's mission is defined based on an extensive analysis of the current situation, the set strategic goals and the needs of practical healthcare, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current LSI in postgraduate education and healthcare. With regard to additional and nonformal education, it was determined that the mission also includes a vision of continuous professional development indicating the final results; it is published to inform all stakeholders.

During the visit and interviews with stakeholders, the experts received reliable information about their participation in the formation of the mission and outcomes.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

To verify **Standard 1** a meeting was held with the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Medical Activities, Adilbek Kairbekovich Mukazhanov. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: "How is professional autonomy manifested?"; "How are students and listeners guaranteed academic freedom?" During the answers, A.K. Mukazhanov confirmed that students of the NSOC LLP are involved in the process of evaluating the EP by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the course of study, in the choice of elective disciplines, and residents have the right to academic mobility, on-site training in residency, publication in the quarterly journal of the NSOC "Oncology.kz" free of charge.

While conducting a survey of 27 residents (on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme. It was found that 63% of residents would recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. 63% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 78% of residents answered positively, 4% are not sure about this, 7% could not answer this question yet and 11% would like to believe it.

During the conversation with the students, information was received about the high-quality acquisition of in-depth knowledge in a narrow medical focus, the development of competencies and skills after completing the training.

The 21 teachers surveyed (21 questions of the questionnaire) also answered that 91% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 9% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees, responds promptly to requests and thereby strengthens the potential of students and students. In the questionnaire, 85% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 15% are partially satisfied. According to 85%, in the educational organization, the teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 21 people responded (36 on staff in total), with 62% having up to 5 years of teaching experience, 19% having up to 10 years, and 19% having over 10 years.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of the residents' previous training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuous professional development programs. The organization has developed 16 continuous professional development (hereinafter referred to as CPD) programs for doctors of various specialties, designed to improve their qualifications, where the most pressing issues and problems are considered. Residents are informed about this. *The interviewed teachers responded that 91% are fully satisfied with the level of residents' previous training, and 9% are partially satisfied. 91% of the teachers-respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 9% partially agree with this.*

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and outcomes

The mission is formulated and the final learning outcomes of the residency programs are defined taking into account the proposals of such stakeholders as potential employers, national public and professional associations, and healthcare organizations. And the programs of additional and non-formal education are based on the proposals of patients, society, organizations and authorized healthcare bodies, professional organizations/associations and medical scientific societies, since there is freedom of expression and freedom of inquiries in the country.

At the same time, when talking with residents, students and employers, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution, for example, of residents to improving the educational programme?". Residents answered these questions that the education department of JSC "NSOC" annually conducts feedback, where they express their opinion on the educational process, and employers answered as follows that they participated in formulating the mission and final results of such residency educational programmes as 7R01114 "Radiology" and 7R01126 "Adult and Paediatric Urology and Andrology".

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply with 14 standards: fully - 14, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

2.1 Model of educational programmes

To implement educational programmes in the specialties 7R01114 "Radiology" and 7R01126 "Urology and Andrology for Adults and Children" in the documents of NSOC LLC there are teaching and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Conformity with the State Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established. While attending a practical lesson for residents on the topic "Focal lesions in the liver", mentor, head of the radiation diagnostics department Dzhakipov M.A., number of students - 7, venue - radiation diagnostics department of the NSOC, volume of hours 2, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve their skills in interpreting CT images, X-ray studies. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of business ethics (Protocol No. 11 dated October 31, 2019) and during the interview, the residents responded that they were informed about the content of this document.

Analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the teaching and methodological complex and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system described in the document Regulation on the clinical mentor of NSOC LLP (No. 262 dated September 12, 2022) was evaluated. There are 63 mentors in total, whose tasks are to assist in adapting to the conditions of practical activity and improving theoretical and practical skills.

Independent training of residents is presented as follows: Analysis of scientific publications from the standpoint of evidence-based medicine on a given topic of the oncological profile; work with educational and additional literature, scientific data, preparation of abstracts and presentations on certain topics, study of scientific publications in periodicals and Internet resources.

The training of students is carried out in accordance with the current policy of professional organizations and on the basis of the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No RK MOH-303/2020 "On approval of the rules for additional and non-formal education of specialists in the field of health care, qualification requirements for organizations implementing educational programmes for additional and non-formal education in the field of health care, as well as the rules for recognizing the learning outcomes obtained by specialists in the field of health care through additional and non-formal education." Classes are held in person (both in a group and individually), as well as using information and computer technologies.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the document "Educational process of resident doctors" Protocol No. 416 dated December 30, 2022, upon familiarization with which they put their signature.

This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the residency educational programme corresponds to the 7th level of the national qualifications framework in medical education and, consequently, the Framework for Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2)

At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the document "Academic Policy of NSOC LLP", No. 226 dated 10.07.2024; the organization does not have information on the official website about the mission and final results of the residency educational programmes and continuous additional education.

2.2 Scientific method

Currently, the NNEC is implementing a project of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan with the participation of residents and young scientists: "Study of Fusobacterium nucleatum and associated colorectal cancer based on modern molecular genetic methods" and scientific and technological progress on the topic: "Proteolytic processing of TAM receptors: implications for the biology of bladder cancer and use of urine biomarkers, 2023-2025. During the interview with the residents, the experts learned that they participate in scientific projects, use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. During the interview with the teachers, they received confirmation of training residents in methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of the "Oncology club", which is held once a month. At the same time, during the meetings with the Academic staff and residents, the experts identified a number of problems, including low scientific activity among residents.

While questioning residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work and 86% of people are completely satisfied with this, 14% are partially satisfied. Residents should engage in R&D and in response to the questionnaire, 42% wrote that they are already engaged in R&D, 24% are planning to start, 26% are looking for a R&D topic, 8% are not engaged.

2.3 Methods of training and teaching

When visiting the EEC of NSOC LLP, the experts were convinced that the teachers actively use both traditional and active teaching methods. Thus, at an open lecture on haematology, conducted for listeners, a brainstorming technique was used when analysing a case (lecturer Ainabay Ayagul Maratovna).

While interviewing residents, it was found out that within the framework of the "Oncology club" a lecture was held on "How to write a clinical trial protocol and register it on ClinicalTrials.gov" speaker: Yesenbaeva G.A. The editor of the NSOC journal "Oncology.kz" systematically conducts training and shares experience with residents and employees on how to write, correctly format and submit articles to domestic and international journals.

Of the 14 residents surveyed, 67% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 22% believe that rarely or sometimes.

2.4 Program structure, content and duration

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes and are regulated by the methodological recommendation "Recommendations for the organization and implementation of educational programmes of additional education in the field of health care", approved by the "National Scientific Centre for Health Development named after Salidat Kairbekova" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty, 2021 and the Academic Policy of the NSOC.

The education department of the NSOC is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including changing conditions and needs of society, amendments and additions to the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, NSOC, as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers. For the successful implementation of residency programs, the organization has resources to organize the assessment of the practical skills of residents (training and simulation centre).

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 60% are completely satisfied, 40% are partially satisfied.

Students of advanced training programs are also provided with reference files, dictionaries, reference books, training systems, self-education programs, educational video and audio recordings, an electronic library (magazines, books in electronic format).

The organization has its own clinical base with 260 beds and 500 outpatient visits, and has also concluded 9 contracts with medical organizations. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 75% of residents answered with full agreement, 25% partially agree. At the same time, 100% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, and works on mistakes).

Clinical training is provided in the conditions of third-party multidisciplinary clinics, and the staffs coordinates training based on these clinics so that residents acquire adequate training in various aspects of the chosen field of medicine. Thus, agreements have been concluded with the following organizations for the training of resident doctors: MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of the Akimat of Astana; MSE "City Children's Hospital No. 1"; MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 2"; CF "University Medical Centre"; RSE "Hospital of the Medical Centre of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM; LLP "Aesthetic Life"; MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" of the Akimat of Astana; MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 3".

At the same time, to the question "Do representatives of residents participate in the development of educational programmes?", the experts received a confirming answer. The surveyed residents are completely satisfied with the schedule of classes (100%).

2.5 Organization of training

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the education department of the NSOC and a conversation with the head of the Zhukubayeva A.A. and employees. At the same

time, the verification of **Standard 2** showed that the structure of the EP complies with regulatory documents and includes a description of the planned teaching methods, assessment methods.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the strategic development department, the science department, and the department of management and development of nursing technologies, the cancer control centre. A total of 5 meetings were held and during the cross-interview it was established that the organization and planning of training is carried out by the teaching staff and the education department upon receipt of applications from students and employees. Based on these applications, the Academic staff develops an EP on the relevant topic, which is submitted for consideration and approval by the Educational and Methodological Council. While visiting a practical lesson on the topic "Focal lesions in the liver", teacher Dzhakipov M.A., 6 hours long and talking with residents, the experts saw that the NSOC promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

The training of residents in the specialties 7R01114 "Radiology" and 7R01126 "Urology and andrology for adults and children" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analysing the shortage of specialists for 2023, a shortage of personnel was found in these specialties. During the survey, teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments of NSOC LLP. Residents of these specialties can supervise patients with specialized diseases, both adults and children. This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in NSOC LLP. **2.6 Process of developing educational programmes**

During the visit, the experts found out that the development of the educational programme consists of 4 stages: preparation for the development of the educational programme, design of the educational programme, detailing of the structural elements of the educational programme, and assessment of the quality of the educational programme project. During the examination in the Register, the experts provided comments and recommendations on the description of the disciplines (add), on the number of learning outcomes (increase), and to add childhood to the disciplines of the elective component. The comments and recommendations were finalized by the developers and the educational programme was successfully included in the Register.

2.7 Procedure for approving educational programmes

After receiving the review (feedback), the educational programme is submitted for consideration and approval at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council. The residency educational programme is reviewed for compliance with the standards, key competencies of resident physicians, the choice of teaching methods and assessment of resident physicians is assessed, the capabilities, resources of the department, and compliance with the qualification requirements of teachers/mentors are evaluated.

After the approval of the EP on the CPD, the developer, together with the Department specialist, submits an online application to the information system "Catalogue of Educational programmes" of the RSE on the REM "National Scientific Centre for Healthcare Development named after Salidat Kairbekova" in order to include the EP in the Register of EPs.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 33 standards, 33 comply fully, 0 partially, 0 do not comply.

Standard 3: COMPETENCY ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION 3.1 Assessment methods

The study of control and measuring tools (50 tests, 20 tasks, 5 cases) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of residents. During the interview, residents talked about the forms of assessment, for example, a portfolio of a resident physician; situational tasks, and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of assessment results is reflected in the document "Academic Policy of NSOC" No. 226 dated

10.07.2024 and during the period of work of the educational organization there were no precedents of appeal.

Thus, to verify the **Standard 3** data, the experts asked questions to the head of the education department Zhukubayeva A.A. and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents and students. During the visit to the organization, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was received - Yes, of course. There are part-time workers from other medical organizations and universities, and independent examination is also carried out.

For students, situational tasks on training programs have been compiled. Thus, the commission was presented with 20 situational tasks on haematology.

During the site visit and interviews with the education department staff, the committee found that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, including documents such as annual operational plans, annual reports, department regulations, faculty and resident agreements, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabi, journals), assessment tools (checklists, reports), certificates, and credentials.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

During interviews with 21 faculty regarding assessment methods, the experts received convincing information that the university views resident assessment as a process of collecting information to make judgments about the degree and nature of the student's progress toward meeting the standard requirements for his or her future work as a physician. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of testing, pre-examination counselling, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure, and its fairness.

The results of the residents' assessment are documented in a paper journal. However, it was found that negotiations are currently underway to purchase the AIS Platonus, which will have an electronic journal.

When interviewing 4 teachers regarding the assessment methods, the experts received convincing information that the assessment of achievements is carried out through the analysis of the resident's portfolio. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting consultations before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. Listeners also expressed their opinions regarding the assessment methods through the analysis of case histories directly in the clinical unit.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, simulation and training classes.

The interviewed 4 representatives of employers also indicated the compliance of graduates' training with the modern development of medical practice and science. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, since they are included in the examination committees. But the educational organization did not conduct systematic feedback with them. Employers believe that such skills as communication and teamwork in residency graduates are the ones they would like to see as the strongest.

3.3 Documentation

Experts have determined that the choice of resident assessment methods is based on OSCE, Mini-CEX, since the practical part of training is the main one. In connection with the achieved successes, the methods of training and assessment of residents, curricula, control and assessment documents are regularly reviewed taking into account feedback from stakeholders.

In the NSOC, the AIS "Platonus" will be launched in the near future (an agreement was concluded with Limited Liability Partnership "Platonus" No. 543 dated 06.08.2024) filling out the information system and entering data is carried out. The entire educational process will be reflected in Platonus. To start the work, there is a classroom with desktop computers with Internet access, access to electronic library databases, there is a conference hall, lecture halls equipped with multimedia equipment.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria correspond out of 14 standards: fully - 13, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To expand the methods for assessing the formed final outcomes of residents/students, ensuring the reliability and validity of the methods used (Standard 3.1.3).

Standard 4: STUDENTS AND LISTENERS

4.1 Admission and selection policy

The experts were convinced that the NSOC implements the policy of admission and selection to residency, focusing on the priorities of the needs of the health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of medical care for the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, provision of educational, material and technical resources of the NSOC.

Having studied the documentation and held a meeting with the employees of the education department, the experts established that applications for residency are accepted from July 3 to July 25 of the calendar year. Entrance exams for residency are held from August 8 to August 16 of the calendar year, enrolment before the start of the school year. Thus, state requirements are met. Enrolment in residency is carried out on the basis of the minutes of the admissions committee and is approved by the order of the Chairman of the Board, which is communicated to applicants.

For the 2024-2025 academic year, a state educational order has been placed at the NSOC, 35 resident doctors have been accepted in the following specialties: adult and paediatric angiosurgery - 3, adult and paediatric anesthesiology and resuscitation - 2, adult and paediatric gastroenterology - 3, adult haematology - 9, general surgery - 5, adult oncology - 4, radiology - 7, adult and paediatric urology and andrology - 2.

Also, in the specialty "General Surgery" 3 resident physicians were accepted by order of the local executive body (LEB) of the Akimat of the city of Astana, on a contractual basis in the specialty "General Surgery" - 1.

The demand for the EP depends on the compliance of the programs with the requirements of professional standards and the needs of practical health care, the competencies of students; the quality of the MTB NSOC, affecting the quality of training of students of the CPD programs.

When interviewing 8 teachers, experts found that they are the developers of 7 certification course programs, which are posted in the Catalogue of educational programmes of the RSE on the Right of Economic Management "National Scientific Centre for Healthcare Development named after Salidat Kairbekova" <u>http://89.218.81.108/#/catalog/view</u>. EPs for advanced training cycles were also sent to the RSE on the REM "National Scientific Centre for Healthcare Development named after Salidat Kairbekova" for examination with the placement of the EP in the Catalogue.

4.2 Motivation

academic year

Before the start of admission to the residency, the NSOC analyses the needs of clinical departments for resident doctors and the level of educational resources of the departments (material and technical, academic, personnel potential). The Admissions Committee provides detailed advice to applicants for residency on the list of residency programs implemented at the centre. For interested applicants for residency, information on each residency programme is freely available on the website (http://cancercenter.edu/kz).

4.3 Number of students and listeners

Number of residents in the current Educational programme

1) "Adult Oncology" - 13;

- 2) "Adult Haematology" 16;
- 3) "Radiology" 18;
- 4) "Adult, Paediatric Gastroenterology" 7;
- 5) "General Surgery" 17;
- 6) "Urology and Andrology for Adults and Children" 9;

Year of commencement of the implementation of **additional and non-formal education programmes**, total number of programs and number of students trained 7) "Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation for Adults and Children" - 10;
8) "Angiosurgery for Adults and Children" - 19; Year of commencement - 2020 Total number of additional education programs - 16 Total students trained - 1164

4.4 Support and counseling

The Admissions Committee provides detailed consultation to residency applicants on the list of residency programs being implemented. Information about the residency is freely available on the website (<u>http://cancercenter.edu/kz</u>).

Academic counselling of residents is provided by specialists of the Education Department throughout the entire period of study. Residents confirmed that consultation is provided on issues of organizing the educational process (academic calendar, schedule, individual curriculum (IEP), and elective component disciplines). Each resident is assigned to a department according to the clinical profile, which ensures and participates in the implementation of the educational programme, the formation of an individual curriculum (IEP), the implementation of clinical, educational and scientific activities. Residents said that a clinical mentor is assigned to them during the mastering of the discipline.

Monitoring and control of the progress of resident doctors is carried out through a survey on satisfaction with the educational process, analysing the educational achievements of residents.

Specialists of the Education Department said that their responsibilities include analysing unintentional incidents in the areas of legal security of residents, transparency of the educational process, protection of personal data, and confidentiality principles. Residents confirmed that specialists of the Education Department are constantly in touch with them and are ready to receive them or answer any question via WhattsApp, Instagram messengers. In general, all personnel adhere to the SOP "Rules for incident management and communication with patients", approved by the order of the chairman of the board of NSOC No. 69-OD dated 16.02.2023.

4.5 Representation of students and listeners

NSOC introduces the practice of including resident doctors in the working groups of departments when developing or updating the EP, when approving the EP at meetings of the Educational and Methodological Council. Resident doctors are participants in the analysis of the MMC (commission for the study of fatal outcomes).

Resident doctors participate in planning the training conditions through the selectivity of elective disciplines of the elective component. They have the right to choose from the CED, in their opinion, the disciplines they need, thereby they participate in making decisions in professional training and skill development regarding them.

The department conducts a survey to satisfy the EP of the residency, which the resident doctor is mastering. The survey results contribute to making changes, revising and updating the program, other documents for the formation of a highly qualified specialist at the level of vision through the eyes of a resident physician.

Resident physicians are included in the Educational and Methodological Council, having the right to vote in the discussions, consideration and approval of academic issues.

4.6 Educational Strategies

NSOC reviewed trends and practices in the field of education and health care, studied the needs of students and listeners, and studied existing teaching approaches. The automated information system "Platonus" is used in the educational process of residency programs, which allows for comprehensive automation of the credit system and DET processes.

4.7 Working Conditions

During a visit to the clinical sites of the NSOC, experts found that the working day for residents is from 8:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. Resident doctors studying under the state educational order are paid a stipend in the established amount - 123,122 tenge. Time is allocated for working in the library, participating in lectures, seminars and conferences, for independent work. If they have a specialist certificate, residents are allowed to carry out independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions. Combining study with work (no more than 0.5 rate) in areas of activity close to his future specialty, in his free time from study, is permitted with the consent of the head of the EP and the head of the Department. Resident doctors are involved in duty according to the schedule of the department and needs.

In accordance with paragraph 32 of the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 No. 595 "On approval of the Model Rules for the activities of higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations" <u>https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017657</u> and in accordance with the Academic Policy of the NSOC, academic leave is granted due to pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave, child care leave), illness, military service upon provision of supporting documents.

Non-formal education of healthcare specialists is carried out upon request in the form of: internships, seminars, trainings, master classes, webinars, and online courses. The duration of the internship, seminar, training, master class, webinar, online course is determined by the healthcare education organization independently.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Compliant out of 31 standards: fully - 31, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Standard 5: PROVISION OF POSTGRADUATE AND ADDITIONAL EDUCATION 5.1 Recognition Policy

During the meeting of the EEC and the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Medical Activities, A.K. Mukazhanov, the experts asked questions about the recognition policy of postgraduate education and continuous professional development (CPD) programs of the NSOC. To which the answer was given that the evidence of recognition is the receipt by the NSOC of a category 1 certificate of compliance with the National Standards for accreditation in the Field of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan for a period of three years, date of issue 03/10/2023; obtaining an accreditation certificate as a subject of scientific and (or) scientific and technical activity No. 000622 dated September 16, 2024, for a period of 5 years and placing the implemented EP in the Register of the Bologna Process Centre of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

5.2 Obligations and development of postgraduate and additional education organizations

During an interview with the head of the education department of the NSOC Zhukubayeva A.A. it was found out that the residency and continuous professional development programs comply with the established regulatory requirements of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Residents/students and teachers are informed about the competencies that they acquire during the training process. This occurs in an environment of transparency and awareness. Thus, the NSOC residency programs are freely available to interested parties in the Registry of the MSHE https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program and on the NPRC website (http://cancercenter.edu/kz), Instagram account https://www.instagram.com/astana.nroc/. Facebook account https:// https://www.facebook.com/astana.nroc.

The NSOC website annually updates and publishes a calendar-thematic plan for the implementation of additional and non-formal education programs for specialists with higher and secondary medical education. The main result of training students in additional and non-formal education programs is the renewal of professional knowledge of healthcare specialists, theoretical and practical skills formed in students during the development of the EP.

5.3 Recruitment and selection policy of teachers

Total staff is 63, including 37 full-time teachers, 0 part-time. The experts were familiar with the HR policy of the NSOC, which is reflected in the Human Resources Management Rules (No. 95 dated 02/28/2023), the Regulation on the clinical mentor (No. 262 dated 09/12/2022)

In order to verify the data of **Standard 5**, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on the HR policy, which includes issues of recruitment and selection for work. The conversation with the teacher Dzhakipov M.A., head of the radiation diagnostics department of the NSOC, included such questions as "How is the assessment of the activities of teachers and mentors carried out, including the assessment of feedback from residents / students to the teacher?", "How is coordination achieved in terms of work schedules and workload?" The answers received allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting clinical base staff for teaching, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting teachers, information support for the educational programme, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources.

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (47%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 32% are partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 24% completely agree, 48% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 56% completely agree, 21% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 44% completely agree, 22% partially.

5.4 Commitments and development of teachers

In order to verify the **Standard 5** data, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts obtained an opinion on approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring, which includes the transfer of experience in the development of professional competencies by students. During a visit to the NSOC, information was obtained that teachers and residents have enough time for teaching, mentoring and training.

It was found that within the framework of the "School of Clinical Mentors" from January 24 to January 28, 2022, a series was held. It is called "Current issues of postgraduate education". This seminar was attended by 35 specialists of the NSOC. As a result of organizing these educational events, the entire faculty of the NSOC was trained.

As part of a strategic partnership with the University Pittsburgh Medical Centre, 30 NSOC clinicians were previously upgraded at UPMC clinics on the implementation of advanced clinical / managerial technologies, including methodological approaches in residency. In 2021-2023, 6 specialists (Charite Clinic) and 14 specialists at the National Cancer Centre (South Korea) were trained in Germany at the expense of the World Bank. The experts checked the certificates of the teachers.

The experts found that the teachers initiate research topics for residents stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. However, according to experts, there is low scientific activity among residents, which requires periodic monitoring by the education department.

The educational organization has opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 83% of surveyed teachers answered, and 17% partially agree with this. Studied in professional development programs - 36% less than 1 year ago, 14% during the current year, 30% more than 3 years ago, 17% more than 5 years ago and 3% answered "I don't remember when it was".

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 87% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 64% "I have already used this", 3% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 10% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Compliance out of 15 standards: fully - 14, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To monitor the evaluation of the activities of teachers/mentors with the development of an assessment sheet and feedback from students (Standard 5.2.4).

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Material and technical support and equipment

During the visit, the experts visited the multidisciplinary clinic of the NSOC, which has all the clinical areas for training - inpatient care (surgical and therapeutic departments, operating room, anaesthesiology and intensive care department), outpatient clinic, diagnostic departments (radiation diagnostics, CT / MRI, X-ray department, endoscopy department, ultrasound diagnostics, functional diagnostics), pharmacy, rehabilitation and physiotherapy department. *Equipment of the radiology department used in training residents:*

1. Stationary digital X-ray machine Siemens Iconos R200

- 1. Stationary digital X-ray machine Stemens Iconos R200
- 2. Computer tomograph Siemens Somatom Emotion 6 slices
- 3. Magnetic resonance tomograph Magnetom C
- 4. Expert class ultrasound machine Logic 9
- 5. Middle class ultrasound machine Samsung
- 6. Middle class ultrasound machine Visit 5

For the program "Urology and andrology for adults, children" there are 92 beds and outpatient visits in clinics and medical centres (according to the concluded Agreements).

There is the MSE on the REM "Oncology centre of Astana". Surgical beds - 30, of which urological - 8. There is the Corporate Fund "University Medical Centre". Multidisciplinary surgery for adults 20 beds, including 2 adult urological beds, 30 paediatric urological beds. A sufficient number of subject patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, teachers provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. The staff of the Scientific and Educational Centre ensures collegial and ethical relationships with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents.

The experts made sure that the training of residents uses modern equipment and software that meets safety standards. Theoretical classes are held in specially equipped classrooms and halls that meet medical standards and practical lessons are held in clinical departments, where students and residents gain practical skills. The following rooms are available for educational events: a small conference hall for 30 people, a small hall for 12 people (administrative block), a large conference hall for 90 people, a lecture hall for 20 people on the 4th floor, a training room (2nd floor) for 10 people. All conference rooms are equipped; there is a portable projector and a laptop for conducting classes in the departments, flipcharts and whiteboards. The experts visited a simulation class opened in 2019. The area is 32 m2. There are mannequins for training urologists-andrologists. Residents can practice practical skills: providing emergency care to patients with cardiopulmonary resuscitation.

The experts visited the library, which has a reading room with 14 seats, equipped with 14 computers connected to the Internet. Education department specialists and interviewed teachers said that lectures are held in the reading room, including online, practical and individual classes with residents.

The electronic library collection includes electronic resources from external sources; electronic copies of publications, electronic educational and methodological publications of the faculty of the NSOC, printed publications, including on urology and andrology. The experts determined that there is enough educational and scientific literature on urology and andrology, and saw that there are publications for the last 3 years. In 2024, 59 books and 23 teaching aids were purchased taking into account a survey of clinical mentors and residents. There is access to international databases. Residents are aware of this.

Agreements on the provision of clinical bases have been concluded with the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 9", the Republican State Enterprise "Hospital of the Medical Centre of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan", the Corporate Fund "University Medical Centre", LLP "Green Clinic", MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 2", MSE on the REM "Oncology Centre of Astana", LLP "Aesthetic Life", LLP "Format", LLP "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre "Meyirim".

Before the start of the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training.

In the near future, it is planned to move to the new buildings of the NSOC, which are equipped with the most advanced medical equipment, which in some places has not previously been presented in Kazakhstan, as well as nuclear and proton medicine centres. The proton centre will be launched for the first time in the country. Today, the new buildings are ready, commissioning work is underway, as well as the acceptance of the building for operation. Innovative approaches in diagnostics include the opening of a nuclear medicine centre in the NSOC, where professionally trained personnel carry out their activities in the synthesis of cyclotron radioactive isotopes, the synthesis of radiopharmaceuticals, positron emission tomography combined with computed tomography (SPECT / CT).

6.2 Training bases

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, 2 clinical bases with a total bed capacity of 310 were visited, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of subject patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously act as teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, an interview was conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, sufficiency of time for patient supervision, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents who need it, participation in the "Oncology club", and the availability of resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients, holding international events.

Residents demonstrated their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their opinions on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research and development, and financing. The experts studied the residents' documents (portfolio, resident assessment results-checklists, resident survey results).

During a visit to clinical sites, experts examined resources, their compliance with training programs, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and how it meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. Thus, a small conference hall for 30 seats, a small hall for 12 seats (administrative block), a large conference hall for 90 seats, a lecture hall for 20 seats on the 4th floor, a classroom (2nd floor) for 10 seats are available for educational events. All conference halls are equipped; there is a portable projector and a laptop for conducting classes in departments, flipcharts and whiteboards.

The experts obtained evidence of **Standard 6** implementation, as well as validation of the selfassessment report data. In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialties 7R01126 "Adult and Paediatric Urology and Andrology" and 7R01114 "Radiology". The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficiency of time for patient care, work in KIIS with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents who need it, participation in the "Oncology club", and availability of resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in patient care, on-site training outside the NSOC.

Residents demonstrated their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their opinions on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the ability to participate in research, and financing, demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from foreign expert Rakhmatullaev A.A. The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of the assessment of residents-checklists, results of the questionnaire of residents).

1.3 Information technology

The experts assessed the access of residents and teachers to the necessary web resources, including access to the Official website <u>http://cancercenter.kz</u> – Home page - About us in the "Education" section in full accessibility for all interested parties. Information educational content is updated constantly. The IT management of the centre ensured the uninterrupted operation of the Internet, created a local computer system, a system of video broadcasts of lectures in classrooms, and implemented distance learning systems (Zoom).

The NSOC has information and communication technologies and electronic media: Documentolog - Electronic document management system; Storage, Public - server for data exchange between departments; CMIS - Clinical medical information system.

Experts have established that the NSOC provides students with access to modern data and literature, providing access to electronic databases, online libraries, within the framework of a cooperation agreement with other educational institutions. Residents are confident that they have the opportunity to use library collections, electronic resources and periodicals in the organization's computer lab. Various events are also held, such as lectures and seminars with experts from third-party organizations who share modern data and literature in their field. All these measures are aimed at providing students with access to relevant and high-quality information, contributing to their professional development and improving their level of knowledge.

6.4 Interaction with colleagues

The results of the meeting of experts with residents of various specialties, including those in accredited programs, showed that residents take an active part in the above-mentioned educational events and are informed about the results. Residents participate in consultations, clinical reviews, and carry out assignments from colleagues within their competence. The skills of coordination of work with colleagues and other healthcare professionals are developed during rounds, examinations, treatment, and emergency care for patients.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 89% of teachers completely agree with this, 11% partially agree.

6.5 Formalized types of training

During the EEC visit, it was found out that the NSOC annually organizes and holds oncology conferences. Thus, in 2022, an international conference was held on the topic: "Scientific and practical aspects of diagnostics and treatment of oncological diseases"; in 2023, from September 6 to 8, an international scientific and practical conference was held on the topic "Central Asian Oncology Week".

The following is planned to be held before the end of this year: II International scientific and practical conference "Topical issues of haematology and bone marrow transplantation".

The centre's specialists regularly take part in scientific and practical conferences and seminars, where students and listeners can share their experience and research results. In addition, the opportunity to participate in webinars and online courses is provided to ensure the availability of educational resources.

6.6 Medical scientific research and achievements

The NSOC implements and develops fundamental and applied scientific research based on

cooperation with leading scientific centres, government agencies of Kazakhstan and international organizations. This year, the MSHE RK Project for young scientists is being carried out: "Study of Fusobacterium nucleatum and associated colorectal cancer based on modern molecular genetic methods" and the Scientific and Technical Program (STP) on the topic: "Proteolytic processing of TAM receptors: implications for the biology of bladder cancer and use urine biomarkers.

Scientific projects planned for 2025-2026 with the general concept of "Creation and implementation of innovative technologies for the treatment of oncological diseases": (1) Use of intraabdominal aerosol chemotherapy under pressure in the complex treatment of patients with locally advanced gastric cancer; (2) Use of decellularized bovine peritoneum in the reconstruction of mammary glands in patients with malignant neoplasms; (3) Application and implementation of innovative intra-pleural hyperthermia chemotherapy for the treatment of patients with primary and metastatic pleural lesions under pressure in the complex treatment of patients with tumour lesions of the pleura; (4) Implementation of haematological tumour therapy technology using the chimeric antigen receptor CAR-T in practical healthcare; (5) Integration of epigenetic markers with machine learning to improve epidemiological approaches to the prevention of chronic non-communicable diseases in adults of reproductive age; (6) Development of innovative biomedical technologies to improve the efficiency of diagnostics and treatment of oncological diseases based on molecular genetic and cellular markers.

Currently, 9 residents of 2-3 years of study are involved in research projects within the residency program. Residents of the NSOC participate in the research project of Nazarbayev University on the topic "TAM receptors as therapeutic targets in the treatment of bladder cancer: preclinical study". All information about scientific work is included in the resident's portfolio.

An interview with 21 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of subject patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). 76% of the respondents-teachers believe that there is enough equipment and resources to conduct training of residents under the accredited program, but 24% partially agree with this statement.

6.8 Training in other institutions

As part of maintaining international cooperation, resident exchange, exchange of experience in the field of medical education, including training (seminars for specialists and residents), Memorandums have been concluded with foreign clinics National Oncology Centre of Korea, Turkey, Israel, Italy, Japan, Denmark, Germany, Russia, France, Great Britain. All information is presented in detail in the report on self-assessment of the educational programme. In addition, 11 Cooperation Agreements were concluded with Kazakhstani organizations: NJSC "Astana Medical University" (No. 19-D-418 dated 05/29/2023); MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" (No. 40 dated 04/19/2023); MSE on the REM "Astana Oncology Centre" (07/08/2019); "Green Clinic" LLP (No. 1 dated 05/10/2023); MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital No. 2" (No. 1 dated 10/05/2020); RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (No. 1 dated 09/15/2021); University Medical Centre Corporate Fund (No. DSIO 1963 dated 10/18/2019); TOO "Aesthetic life" (No. 115 dated 20.11.2020); LPP "Format" dated 05.02.24; LLP "Multi-disciplinary medical centre "Meyirim" dated 24.10.23; Research Institute of Traumatology and Orthopaedics named after Academician N.D. Batpenov No.1 dated 29.08.2024.

The experts got acquainted with all the Agreements during their visit to the education department.

NSOC implements academic mobility programs for teachers and invitation of visiting professors in accordance with the goals and needs of students and staff, observing ethical principles. The implementation of these programs promotes the internationalization of education and integration into the global educational space and complies with the policy of NSOC.

The experts studied the documentation on the methods of training residents. And when interviewing residents and teachers, they found confirmation of the data of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme. Theoretical teaching methods are used: lectures, seminars,

oral presentations, video conferences. Interactive methods of theoretical teaching are used; training based on simulation technologies, the "brainstorming" method, the group discussion method, portfolio, combined survey, simulation technologies, and presentations. The main share is clinical training (practical skills): patient management, clinic shifts, participation in clinical analyses of complex cases and rounds of professors and associate professors, in surgical interventions of varying complexity, followed by a report at morning conferences, preparation of a report on the activities of departments, organization and participation in trainings with doctors, practicing practical skills in a simulation room.

Teachers are trained in advanced training courses to confirm their specialist certificate every 5 years. Such training is 80% provided by the NSOC. Training in pedagogical skills is presented in standard 5. In 2023, 20 physician mentors underwent training on the topic "School of a clinical mentor; Current issues in postgraduate education."

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Compliant out of 25 standards: fully - 24, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendation for improvement:

1) To expand contractual relations with regional, international oncology organizations for the promotion and recognition of continuous professional development programs with on-site training (Standard 6.7.2).

Standard 7: ASSESSMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

To monitor the implementation of the educational programme and as emerging problems are identified, the following documents have been approved and updated in the NSOC: The implementation of educational activities is carried out in accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal - academic policy, approved by order No. 226 dated July 10, 2024; Regulations on the educational and methodological council, approved by order of the Chairman of the Board No. 124-OD dated July 18, 2019

The NSOC monitors the processes and results of training using control and measuring tools. These include test assignments, situational tasks, tickets, questions, tests and other materials for the end-of-course assessment of students' knowledge, necessary for monitoring the theoretical and clinical achievements of a specialist and aimed at determining the compliance of the knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies acquired by him.

Computer testing allows you to determine the increase in students' knowledge improves the level and quality of training in advanced training and retraining cycles, develops the ability to quickly and correctly navigate when choosing an answer from several proposed options.

The NSOC uses software (easyQuizzy) to test students with graphic support (diagrams, graphs, diagrams, drawings, etc.).

7.2 Feedback

In order to monitor graduates of the residency program, a survey is conducted on the "360 Assessment" questionnaires upon graduation from residency, then after their employment in medical organizations, graduates are offered to complete a survey to assess their satisfaction with the level of professional training at the NSOC. The questions in the questionnaire are formulated in such a way that students / listeners not only share their impressions of the course they have taken, but also the possibilities of applying the knowledge they have gained in their practical activities.

Based on the results of the feedback survey, students are provided with study rooms, their social conditions have improved (they are provided with lockers for changing clothes, new office equipment), and they take part in various master classes and seminars in the following areas with the participation of foreign specialists.

The share of residency graduates who passed the final state certification procedure and received "good" and "excellent" grades from the total number of graduates in 2022 was 100%, in 2023 - 100%.

7.3 Stakeholder Involvement

The NSOC engages key stakeholders in the program to monitor and evaluate the educational programme, including: (1) Since 2018, independent assessment of residents' knowledge has been conducted by the National Centre for Independent Examination; (2) Employers (medical institutions of the regional health departments of the Republic) - creation of an effective system for promoting employment and adaptation of graduates to the labour market; (3) NSOC - provides educational services to residents of third-party organizations in specialized disciplines, students and residents of Nazarbayev University and residents of the EMC Faculty of Medicine; (4) Open Day for applicants wishing to enrol in the NSOC residency programs; (5) Representatives of public associations of doctors (associations of doctors) - organize scientific and practical conferences on topical issues of medical education and the specialty; (6) Annual seminars and lectures in universities of the country on the prevention and early diagnosis of cancer; (7) The NSOC is the coordinator for the oncohematology service in the republic and is responsible for training personnel in the specialty of "Adult Haematology".

The results of the feedback and "360-degree analysis" are discussed at meetings of the UMS and decisions are made on further corrective actions. The members of the EMC include heads of departments, key persons in residency from among the teaching staff, resident doctors, and, depending on the agenda, other interested persons may be invited. Thus, the NSOC provides maximum access to the results of the evaluation of the NSOC residency programs to all interested parties.

Interviews with 4 employers were conducted via ZOOM conference) and included questions such as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in developing the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the development of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply out of 17 standards: fully - 16, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendation for improvement:

1) While evaluating educational programmes, more actively involve stakeholders and, on this basis, carry out corrective measures to update the EP (Standard 7.2.6).

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Documentation and requirements for education planning

The implementation of the residency program is carried out in accordance with the state license for the right to educational activities in residency (No. KZ59LAA00035999 dated 12/14/2023). The implementation of the residency program is controlled by the EMC, is carried out in the departments and outpatient clinic of the NSOC, external clinical bases, and is supported by the Department.

The NSOC has developed an internal regulatory document on the internal system for evaluating the quality of education of additional and non-formal education programs and residency, which contains indicators of the quality of education, quality control of education, monitoring of educational results, internal and external examination.

The order of the deputy chairman of the board approves the heads of the educational programme responsible for its implementation, the calendar and thematic plan of the AT of specialists with higher and secondary medical and pharmaceutical education. Educational programmes and educational and methodological complexes of disciplines (EMCD) for each specialty are developed by the teaching staff participating in the implementation of the EP on additional education. While developing educational programmes and teaching and methodological complexes, an examination is carried out to determine the correctness of the design and compliance of the content of these documents. If deficiencies are identified in the design or content of the main educational and methodological

documentation, the materials are returned to the teaching staff for revision and bringing them into compliance with the requirements.

8.2 Academic leadership

In accordance with standard documents, the NSOC has developed and approved regulations for each division, defining the structure, management and accountability, goals, objectives and functions of structural divisions, as well as job descriptions for each position provided for in the staffing table. The governing body of the NSOC is the Board, Chairman - Burkitbayev Zhandos Konysovich

The Chairman of the Board of the NSOC is appointed to the position and dismissed from the position by the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and bears personal responsibility for the financial and economic activities, the safety of the property of the NSOC, for the organization of combating corruption, establishes the competence of the Deputy Chairmen of the Board and other senior employees of the NSOC, independently resolves all issues of the activities of the NSOC in accordance with its competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Charter of the NSOC.

Residency issues are supervised by the Deputy Chairman of the Board for scientific and educational activities of the NSOC. The Education Department is responsible for organizing residency programs. The Education Department is managed by the Head of the Department, Almira Assetkyzy Zhukubayeva, appointed to the position by the order of the Head of the NSOC following an open competition.

To the question in the questionnaire "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work?", 100% of teachers answered that they do so systematically."

8.3 Allocation of the budget and resources for education

Financing of educational activities (training of employees, acquisition and maintenance of educational equipment, mobility of students and teaching staff, etc.) is carried out at the expense of income from own activities and allocated funds from the republican budget. Budget planning, accounting and financial reporting are carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan on accounting and financial reporting and accounting policies.

The Financial Service monitors the Education Department's compliance with the requirements of legislative and other regulatory acts governing its activities; provides the management with objective and timely information on activities to achieve sustainable success, as well as monitoring and control over the elimination of violations identified in the course of performing functions.

8.4 Administration

The organizational structure of the NSOC is presented as follows: Chairman of the Board, First Deputy Chairman of the Board, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Medical Activities, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific and Educational Activities, Managing Director for Nursing, Managing Director for Human Resources, Managing Director for the Development of Medical and Digital Innovations.

Educational issues are handled by the Education Department (Head Zhukubaeva A.A., Master of Pedagogy and Psychology), which is supervised by the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific and Educational Activities.

The main objectives of the department are:

- 1) development of educational activities of the NSOC;
- 2) implementation of postgraduate education programs (residency);

3) implementation of additional and non-formal education for specialists of the Scientific and Educational Center and third-party organizations (advanced training courses, seminars, master classes, etc.);

4) conduct training for students in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards, as well as organize and coordinate educational and educational-methodical work;

The following are involved in resolving educational issues: the legal support department, the quality control and management department, the financial block, the administrative and economic

activity block, IT, the human resources management department, the science department, and clinical departments.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

Residency training is carried out by educational residency programs, the list of which is approved by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021 No. RK MOH - 43 "On approval of the list of medical specialties of residency programs"

Residency programs are included in the Register of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education of the Bologna Process Centre of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which confirms their compliance with the requirements and regulations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The training of students is carried out in accordance with the current policy of professional organizations and on the basis of the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No RK MOH-303/2020 "On approval of the rules for additional and non-formal education of specialists in the field of health care, qualification requirements for organizations implementing educational programmes for additional and non-formal education in the field of health care, as well as the rules for recognizing the learning outcomes obtained by specialists in the field of health care through additional and non-formal education"

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Comply out of 16 standards: fully - 16, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Over the past 5 years, the Strategic Plan and the Long-Term Plan for 2024-2028 have been developed and approved towards improvement. The mission and vision of the NSOC have been updated. The organizational structure approved on August 1, 2024, clearly demonstrates the transformations in the regulatory documentation in the educational and scientific spheres. During the changes, the following were divided and separated into separate structures: the education department and the science department. New sectors were additionally included in the education department: the additional and postgraduate education sector, the library, the teaching sector, and the educational and simulation centre.

A nuclear medicine centre has been created within the structure of the NSOC, where radionuclide pharmaceuticals (hereinafter referred to as RP) will be used for diagnostics and treatment. Radionuclide diagnostics will use single-photon emission computed tomography (hereinafter referred to as SPECT), which capture gamma radiation, and positron emission tomography (hereinafter referred to as PET scanners), and radioiodine therapy will prevail in treatment.

In 2025, it is planned to commission new buildings that will be equipped with the most advanced medical equipment. The NSOC plans to introduce the proton beam therapy method, which is an unambiguous method of choice with minimization of the risks of irradiation of healthy organs and tissues for the treatment of malignant neoplasms.

For the diagnosis and treatment of malignant neoplasms, the NSOC will be equipped with the entire necessary medical and diagnostic equipment, such development of educational resources will increase the number of educational services provided, which in turn will increase the expertise and pedagogical skills of the faculty.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Compliance out of 6 standards: fully - 6, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Thus, during the external institutional assessment, compliance was established with 107/65 standards for accreditation, including 105 basic standards and 60 improvement standards. 2 basic standards and 5 improvement standards were partially met. Non-compliance with standards was not found.

5. Recommendations for improvement of institutional activities of "NSOC" LLP:

1) To expand the methods for assessing the final outcomes of residents/students, ensuring the reliability and validity of the methods used (Standard 3.1.3);

2) To monitor the evaluation of the activities of teachers/mentors by developing an assessment sheet and providing feedback from students (Standard 5.2.4);

3) Ro expand contractual relations with regional and international oncology organizations to promote and recognize continuous professional development programs by conducting on-site training (Standard 6.7.2);

4) While conducting an evaluation of educational programmes, more actively involve stakeholders and, on this basis, carry out corrective measures to update educational programmes (Standard 7.2.6).

Приложение 1.

		(обобщ	ение)			
				C)ценка	
Standard	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	Базовые стандарты/ Стандарты улучшения	Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	14	6/8	6/8		
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ ПРОГРАММЫ	33	23/10	23/10		
3.	ОЦЕНКА КОМПЕТЕНЦИЙ И ДОКУМЕНТАЦИЯ	15	12/3	12/2	0/1	
4.	ОБУЧАЮЩИЕСЯ И СЛУШАТЕЛИ	31	21/10	21/10		
5.	ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЕ ПОСЛЕДИПЛОМНОГО И ДОПОЛНИТЕЛЬНОГО ОБРАЗОВАНИЯ	15	9/6	9/5	0/1	
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	25	14/11	14/10	0/1	
7.	ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫХ ПРОГРАММ	17	9/8	9/7	0/1	
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	16	10/6	10/6		
9.	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	6	3/3	3/3		
	Итого:	172	107/65	107/61	0/4	
					172	

Профиль качества и критерии внешней институциональной оценке ННОЦ (обобщение)

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP with the Standards for Accreditation and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman of the EEC	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	Sien
International Expert	Rakhmatullaev Akmal Abadbekovich	Aderac
Academic Expert	Dzhambulova Bela Telmanovna	
Academic Expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	
Employer Expert	Ospanova Madina Yeralievna	Ah
Student Expert	Aida Kabyldina	My -

Приложение 2

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки организации образования ТОО «ННОЦ»

N⁰	Наименования документов	Количество
1.	Отчет о выполнении Плана мероприятий по реализации	1
	рекомендаций ВЭК (2019 года)	
2.	Договор №386 от 01.10.2024г. на программно-целевое	1
	финансирование по теме программы №ИРН BR24992950 «Создание	
	и внедрение инновационных методик лечения онкологических	
	заболеваний»	
3.	Отчет по самооценке «ННОЦ» на соответствие стандартам	1
	институциональной аккредитации	
4.	Приложение к отчету	1
5.	ОП «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	1
6.	Силлабусы	1
7.	Чеклисты	1
8.	План развития ТОО ННОЦ	
9.	Правила внутреннего распорядка для обучающихся	1
10.	Договор о совместной деятельности №370	1
11.	Аттестация резидентов 2 года обучения по учебным годам	1
12.	Портфолио резидентов/слушателей	5
13.	Список публикации штатных ППС по специальности «Урология и	1
	андрология взрослая, детская»	
14.	Повышение профессиональной и педагогический квалификации	1
	штатных преподавателей по специальности «Урология и андрология	
	взрослая, детская»	
15.	Повышение педагогический квалификации клинических наставников	1
	по специальности «Урология и андрология взрослая, детская»	
16.	Укомплектованность научной и учебной литературы ТОО ННОЦ	1
17.	Список опубликованных работ резидентами по специальности:	1
	«Урология и андрология взрослая, детская» за период 2020 по 2023 гг	
18.	Сведения о финансировании и основных расходах на обучение (к	1
	Standard 8 «Управление и администрирование», п.8.3)	
19.	Академическая политика	1
20.	Состав Ученого совета	1
21.	Кодекс деловой этики	1